Page 1 of 17



INFORMATION CALENDAR March 10, 2020

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

From: Dee Williams-Ridley, City Manager

Submitted by: Phillip L. Harrington, Director, Department of Public Works

Subject: Audit Status Report: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan,

and Communication Needed to Continue Progress towards the Year 2020

Zero Waste Goal

INTRODUCTION

The Office of the City Auditor presented to the City Council a July 1, 2014 Report: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal¹ (Audit Report). The City Auditor conducted the Audit Report at the Public Works Director's request to assess Public Works' Zero Waste Division progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal. This is the fourth Information Calendar Update on the efforts made to implement the Audit Report's recommendations.

CURRENT SITUATION AND ITS EFFECTS

The Audit Report noted fifteen (15) recommendations for the Public Works Department (PWD) and its Zero Waste Division (ZWD) to review, implement and report to Council. The first set of seven (7) recommendations were related to zero waste goals and ZWD's operational components and the second set of eight (8) recommendations focused on PW/ZWD working with the Department of Information Technology (IT) to utilize technology to interface with routes, staff and the customers.

As of the writing of this Audit Report, three recommendations have been implemented, eight recommendations are partially implemented; three recommendations remain unimplemented; and one recommendation has been declined with a will not implement status.

At the September 17, 2019 City Council Work Session, Public Works, Zero Waste Division and its consultant presented a five (5) year Zero Waste Fund Rate Review that will support funding for additional resources for the Zero Waste Division work to meet the City's Zero Waste Goal. The Rate Review includes funding for additional staffing at the Division for implementation and/or compliance with the State's and StopWaste.org

https://www.cityofberkeley.info/uploadedFiles/Auditor/Level_3_-General/A%202 RPT Zero%20Waste Final.pdf

Page 2 of 17

Audit Status Report -- Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress
Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal

INFORMATION CALENDAR March 10, 2020

recycling mandates, Single Use Disposal Foodware and Litter Reduction Ordinance²; an RFP solicitation for the development of a Strategic Plan that will identify the City's path to meet its Zero Waste Goal; and next steps needed to replace the existing Solid Waste & Recycling Transfer Station³. Please see Attachment 1 for a detailed table of audit report recommendations, corrective actions and implementation progress. The next Council report is anticipated on March 23, 2021 to update progress on the remaining audit items.

BACKGROUND

On March 22, 2015, the Berkeley City Council adopted Zero Waste Resolution No. 62,849-N.S reaffirming its commitment to meet the Alameda County Measure D goal of reducing waste sent to landfills by 75%, and setting a goal of zero waste sent to landfills by year 2020. The Resolution does not define a specific zero waste percentage expectation for Berkeley, but the language used therein implies that the Council's intention is diversion of 100 percent of waste from landfills.

In its October 17, 2017 presentation of the Zero Waste Strategic Plan to the City Council, the Zero Waste Commission recommended the City move forward immediately to meet our Zero Waste Goal by updating the Zero Waste Goal for current feasibility and issuing an RFP to hire a consultant to develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan intended to lead the City toward that goal. The City Council consented to this recommendation.

ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY

The increased diversion of recyclable materials, such as, cardboard, paper, plastic, etc., from the wastes being landfilled is an essential part of the City's Zero Waste Goal as described in the City's 2009 Climate Action Plan.

POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION

The Zero Waste Commission and the Zero Waste Division are continuing to address the remaining nine recommendations in the Audit.

FISCAL IMPACTS OF POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION

There will be fiscal impacts for the procurement of software, hardware, and professional services necessary to complete the Audit findings. Public Works will continue to update the Council on a periodic basis on the progress, resources available or to be made available, and/or additional funding needs in subsequent updates assessing Zero Waste Division's efforts.

²

https://www.cityofberkeley.info/Public_Works/Zero_Waste/Berkeley_Single_Use_Foodware_and_Litter_R eduction Ordinance.aspx

³ https://www.cityofberkeley.info/Clerk/City_Council/2019/11_Nov/City_Council__11-05-2019_-Special Meeting Agenda.aspx

Page 3 of 17

Audit Status Report -- Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, INFORMATION CALENDAR and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal

March 10, 2020

CONTACT PERSON

Greg Apa, Solid Waste & Recycling Manager (510) 981-6359

Attachment:

1. Audit Findings and Recommendations Response Form

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
Request the City Council to redefine and then reaffirm its commitment to zero waste (i.e., the percentage that the Council considers to be success), and to ensure sufficient resources to fund appropriate staffing and the necessary infrastructure to achieve stated goals by 2020.	Public Works	Agree This is consistent with the strategic approach the Public Works Department has taken to correct operational deficiencies and create an organization more capable of continuing the work to reach the City's zero waste goal. The Department is poised to undertake an open search for a new ZWD Manager whose input, perspective, and anticipated professional expertise will be essential in analyzing the resources necessary to achieve the goal and drafting suitable recommendations to Council.	June 2015 June 2019 December 2019 November 2020	by 2020 resolution 5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented The Zero Waste Commission submitted to the City Council its recommendation for the City to develop an RFP to: 1) develop a Zer Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The City Council concurred with this recommendation which was an item on its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar for the Zero Waste Division to develop the RFP for the development of the Plan. 6/04,2018 Update: Not Implemented The RFP is in development and should be released to solicit propose to be submitted during the second quarter FY2019. March 12, 2019 Partially Implemented ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Pl (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review. March 10, 2020 Update Partially Implemented At the September 17, 2019 City Council Work Session, Public Works and its consultant presented the proposed 5 year Rate Review that includes additional staffing for implementation and compliance wit State and StopWaste.org mandatory recycling and food waste. The Council provided input on the Rate Review in review and adjusted Rates with be presented to the City Council mid-2020.

Waste Goal							
dings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary			
2 Draft and obtain Council approval of a written strategic plan to achieve zero waste by 2020, including annual or biennial interim waste diversion goals. Topics that the strategic plan should discuss include: • Objectives and longterm and interim goals • Actions to be taken • Responsible parties • Expected cost and impact of implementation • Performance measures • External factors affecting performance and progress	Public Works	Agree The Public Works Department has taken a strategic approach to solving the structural deficit and making progress toward our zero waste goal. The Department improved the efficiency of operations, followed the strategies in the Climate Action Plan, is currently completing a commercial franchise study, and in May 2014 completed a Prop 218-compliant rate increase. PW will continue to focus on maintaining efficient operations, high quality customer service, and improvements to waste diversion efforts. The Department will take the next step toward zero waste by reassessing the current situation, and developing a strategic plan intended to guide the Department through the increasingly difficult path to zero waste. Part of this process requires evaluating the existing Transfer Station infrastructure, along with what might be required to reach the zero waste goal as defined. The strategic plan will be flexible so that annual work plans can be designed to address changing conditions. Public Works will build upon relevant content in the 2005 Solid Waste	June 2015 June 2019 June 2019 December 2019 May 2021	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented The City's Solid Waste Management Plan (1998) and Source Reduction and Recycling Element (1992) are the City's most recent documents guiding the City's actions toward the goal of zero waste. Although the City's Solid Waste Management Plan Update (2005) wasn't formerly adopted by the City, it was designed to achieve the 2010 goal of reaching 75% diversion. The City is currently achieving 76% diversion based on FY2015 information. The Zero Waste Commission and the City Auditor each concluded independently that a comprehensive, written strategic plan that clearly defines roles and responsibilities and assigns sufficient resources is needed to guide the City towards the goal of achieving zero waste. The Zero Waste Commission recommended and the Cit Council concurred at its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar concurred with Zero Waste Commission's recommendation for Public Works' Zero Waste Division to develop an RFP to: develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan to delineate terminology, define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and develop plan to attain the define Strategic Plan's Zero Waste Goal. 6/04,2018 Update: Not Implemented These issues will be included in the development of RFP that will be advertised for proposals the second quarter FY2019. March 12, 2019 Partially Implemented ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Pla (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review. March 10, 2020 Update Partially Implemented When implemented When implemented and verifiable customer information			

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal						
Fin	dings and Recommendations	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan Action Plan, and incorporate input from the Zero Waste Commission.	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary		
					customer data, so a Request for Proposals (RFP) for strategic plan preparation is contingent upon the new software being fully in-place The implementation is projected to be complete in late 2020.	
1.3	Prepare detailed annual work plans that contain: Objectives Annual/biennial (short-term) goals Actions to be taken Budget allocated for the actions Timeline for completion Lead staff responsible for task completion Full-time equivalent employees assigned to the tasks Performance measures	Public Works	Agree Public Works will continue to prepare its annual work plan under the direction of the City Manager, in coordination and consistent with other Department work plans. Goals, objectives, and actions for the Zero Waste program will be organized and managed by the Zero Waste Manager.	December 2019	January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented The Zero Waste Commission submitted to the City Council its recommendation for the City to develop an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The City Council concurred with this recommendation which was an item on its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar for the Zero Waste Division to develop the RFP for the development of the Plan. With a third-party firm in-place, the Plan development will proceed with all stakeholders' input solicited, reviewed and included. With approved by both the Zero Waste Commission and City Council, a fully vetted and approved Zero Waste Strategic Plan will provide Public Works a detailed road map to attain a zero waste goal. With these elements agree to then annual/biennial goals, budget allocations, timelines for completion, employees' assigned task and performance measures will be concisely identified and assigned to meet the zero waste goal. March 12, 2019 Partially implemented ZWD is drafting an RFP for a Zero Waste Strategic plan to guide the City's policy and decision making and paths of implementation to the goal of Zero Waste. IT and ZWD is in the process of selecting a vendo to implement an entirely new ZW software solution that includes routing, billing and work orders. ZW meets weekly with key PW staff to ensure division objectives and action items are prioritized and budgeted for. With the first reading and passing of the Single Use Foodware and Litter Reduction Ordinance on January 22, 2019, ZWD is working closely with PW Fiscal and Admin division to budget for adequate staffing for this new responsibility. ZWD anticipates completion of a Feasibility Study to replace the existing Transfer Station by mid-2019. ZWD primary objectives are in accordance with	

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
			May 2022	the Citywide Strategic Plan. Once the new ZW software system is in place and the Strategic Plan has been completed, a more accurate work plan could be created that would include performance measures. March 10, 2020 Update Partially Implemented When implemented, the Zero Waste Division's new management software will provide accurate and verifiable customer information (i.e., something the current software cannot do). A Zero Waste strategic plan would be strongly informed by accurate and verifiable customer data, so a Request for Proposals (RFP) for strategic plan preparation is contingent upon the new software being fully in-place. The implementation is projected to be complete in late 2020. After both the software installation and the Zero Waste strategic plan are completed, the City can issue an RFP for a new user-friendly routing system. The new Routing system will enable development of reliable verifiable and accurate performance metrics. The cost of these systems and additional staffing required have been included in projected budgets
1.4 Regularly communicate zero waste goals and achievements to City staff and the Council, and offer training to staff on how they can help Berkeley achieve zero waste. This includes sharing strategic and annual work plan goals and regular updates regarding progress and completion.	Public Works	Agree Prepare an annual report to Council, highlighting progress toward strategic plan and work plan goals to achieve zero waste in Berkeley.	December 2019	January 23, 2018 Update: Partially Implemented With the newly re-staffed ZWC and new management at Zero Waste Division and once the Strategic Plan is completed and as part of the Strategic Plan, the Work Plan with goals, budget, timelines, FTEs and measurements will be developed. Then, Public Works will initiate annual reporting to Council. Nonetheless progress has been made, such as: the ZWD has undertaken a City Facilities Greening Project to ensure that all City-owned facilities have the appropriate containers with signage for trash, recyclables (bottles/cans and fiber), and organics; and that City staff receive training on the acceptable materials to place in each container type. The recent, May through September 2017, renovation of 1947 Center Street is being used as a pilot for this Project. In celebration of Earth Day 2017, the ZWD hosted a Zero Waste Eart Day Fair for City employees to get answers to all of their recycling-related questions, play games, enjoy zero waste snacks, and talk tra with ZWD staff. This event was attended by more than 100 City

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal						
Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept. Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary			
1.5 Determine if additional funds are needed for the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero waste goals. If sufficient funds are not available, propose to Council a separate fee to cover those costs for the City's zero- waste program, such as a regulatory fee as allowed under Proposition 218.	Public Works	Agree The Public Works Strategic Plan process will evaluate and identify the necessary resources, and if funding is insufficient, a recommendation will be made to consider an Integrated Waste Management Fee or other appropriate mechanism to fund additional staffing and/or outreach needs.	November 2021 December 2019	March 12, 2019 Partially Implemented City staff have been encouraged to participate in the visioning sessions for the Transfer Station Redesign January 16, 17, and 18, 2019. Also, ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal The RFP is in administrative review. Once the strategic plan is completed, it will be shared with City staff. March 10, 2020 Update Partially Implemented At the Council's Work Sessions for Rate Review (September 17, 201 and Solid Waste & Recycling Transfer Station Feasibility Study (November 5, 2019), the Public Works department informed Counc of the need for additional RFPs, staffing, funding and facility requirements to meet the City's zero waste goal. 5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Partially Implemented Since September 2016, Public Works has hired the Zero Waste Division's Solid Waste & Recycling Manager, Greg Apa, and Recyclin Program Manager, Heidi Obermeit, who have 29 and 10 years, respectively, of solid waste industry experience. With their extensib background in the solid waste industry, they are in the process of reviewing, assessing and addressing Zero Waste's current efforts to educate and as needed the expansion of educational outreach to the community members and commercial businesses, both existing and new. Outreach educational materials are somewhat dated and the materials may be updated and customized as required with more current graphics and narratives. In addition, the ZWD has hired a Field Service Representative who assists ZWD's education and compliance efforts with all community members and businesses. In 2018, the current Council approved rate structure will require an updated rate study including the cost of increased educational outreach and training for handling of recyclable materials to ensure		

Find	dings and Recommendations	Lead Dept. Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan		Expected or Actual Implementation Date	sustainable rate structure to achieve the zero waste goals that the Council has set for Public Waste and Zero Waste Division. March 12, 2019 Partially Implemented Public Works has determined through internal budget process that Zero Waste needs two additional full time staff members to oversee the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero-waste goals. The Zero Waste Division will be determining additional funding beyond staffing needed to increase education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement during the strategic plannin process. The RFP for the strategic plan process is currently under administrative review. This process will also identify if the current levels of fees can cover the costs of the City's Zero Waste program o if Public Works will need to assess additional fees. March 10, 2020
				November 2020	
1.6	Update the City's Zero Waste website to include easily accessible information regarding: • How and where to recycle materials that are not accepted in curbside collection. • What can be brought to the transfer station and materials	Public Works	Agree	October 2016	January 23, 2018 Update: Implemented With the hiring of the Recycle Program Manager, ZWD is continuousl streamlining and updating the City's and ZWD's website to include: guidelines to recycle plant debris and food waste; information on the mandatory recycling requirements for businesses and multi-family properties in Alameda County; and links to other recycling resources in the area. Further, the ZWD has made available guidelines to help designers of multifamily, commercial, and mixed-use buildings plan for recycling collection when designing new buildings or renovations. In conjunction with the City's Public Information Officer, the ZWD has distributed press releases to educate the general public about the appropriate material to place in their refuse, recycling and green

Findi	ings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
	recovery facility. • Zero waste goals and progress toward those goals. StopWaste.org is a good example and has resources that Berkeley can direct customers to use. Updates should be made as changes are made to the list of materials accepted through each waste				compost carts, extra pick-up bags, proper cart placement.
1.7	Engage in discussions with the California Department of Resources Recycling and Recovery to obtain permission to collect garbage biweekly instead of weekly while maintaining weekly collection of compostables. Perform additional education and outreach prior to implementing biweekly garbage service to educate the public on the change. Alternatively, seek permission to implement a pilot project for biweekly garbage	Public Works	Agree The ZWD will investigate the process of obtaining legal permission to pilot biweekly rubbish collection. We will identify the operational and outreach preparation necessary to evaluate the feasibility of this pilot.	N/A	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Will not be Implemented Although a Solid Waste & Recycling Manager and Recycling Program Manager is on staff, the Zero Waste Division, as an enterprise funded collection service division, is unstaffed and inexperienced to engage in the process change of State Law, which requires weekly collection of refuse. In addition, this would require significant lobbying of CalRecycle to approve a pilot program to collect refuse other than on a weekly basis. The Audit Report states that there is the potential of \$496,000 annua cost savings by switching to biweekly garbage service. However and as noted in the Audit Report, this is based on assumptions which: 1) State law requires the refuse shall not remain on any premises more than seven (7) days. Berkeley would need to revise the State law, request a waiver or seek permission for a pilot program. This waiver or revision of State law will potentially require substantial lobbying members of City Council, State House of Representative(s) and Senator(s), as well as, of all the many County and State permitting and health agencies that would be involved to amend State law.

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
service.				 2) Require additional staff and funding to support a community educational outreach to ensure that refuse is not just reallocated by community members to the recycling and plant debris carts. 3) Public Works would need to enter into negotiations with the employee bargaining unit to an agreement whether positions can be eliminated through attrition or reassignment.
	1	ies affects operational efficiencies		
2.1 Work with the Department of Information Technology to configure the CRM system with a required field that auto populates valid route information based on address and service delivery type so that route specific data can be collected on a going-forward basis.	Public Works	Agree	December 2019	January 23, 2018 Update: Not implemented Currently the City is implementing an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) project to replace the FUND\$ system including the CRM application. ERP is a software with financial (accounting, billing, budget, contracts) and human resource (time entry, personnel, payroll, benefits) applications. As part of this project, ZWD has been working with IT and its consultant during the needs assessment phas to ensure that RouteSmart™ will interface with the selected software June 4, 2018 Update: Not implemented IT with ZWD is soliciting many companies to demonstrate their invoicing, customer service, and routing systems. With the conclusion of the demonstrations, IT will develop an RFP that will soloist proposals for systems that will integrate with erma. March 12, 2019 Not Implemented IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. As the FUND\$ system is in the process of being replaced, a new system was deemed necessary and IT issued an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. One proposal was received. If the proposal is accepted, software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019. The new system will require route optimization and will have an onboard system for drivers containing route information based on address and service delivery type so that route-specific data can be

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal					
Findings and Recommendations		Lead Dept. Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary	
				November 2022	collected on a going-forward basis. The details of this system will be evaluated and developed as part of implementation. In addition to these new systems, Public Works and Parks are also implementing a new computerized maintenance management system. Once that vendor has been selected, then 311 will issue an RFP for a new Customer Relationship Management system that will integrate with the Zero Waste solutions. March 10, 2020 Update Not Implemented IT is finalizing the contract for a new Zero Waste software management system, installation of which is projected to be completed in late 2020. After this software is in operation, RFPs will be issued for new Routing and CRM system(s). When these are operational, CRM will be able to integrate routing information,
2.2	Work with the Department of Information Technology to create a link between RouteSmart and the CRM system (or the software implementation of Recommendation 2.5 below).	Public Works	Agree Zero Waste will work with IT to create the most efficient link between RouteSmart™ and the CRM system that can be created, given available resources. One solution, budget permitting, would be implementing the best of breed billing system that integrates with RouteSmart, rather than to trying to configure the CRM system to handle functions it was never designed to handle.	April 2015 December 2019	January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented IT has been able to create a table that extracts customer information from the FUND\$ and RouteSmart™. However and due to the limitations of FUND\$, this link takes hours to download information into RouteSmart™ versus that the company states should take minutes. Therefore until the installation of the ERP process is completed, RouteSmart™ cannot be used to its full route optimizatio capabilities. March 12, 2019 Not Implemented Working with RouteSmart for further integration was deemed not worthwhile as that system does not integrate with ArcGIS which is the City's primary system for spatial data. IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. The RFP was for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. One proposal was received. If the proposal is accepted, software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019.

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
			November 2022	implementing a new computerized maintenance management system. Once that vendor has been selected, then 311 will issue an RFP for a new Customer Relationship Management system that will integrate with the Zero Waste solutions. March 10, 2020 Update: Not Implemented After evaluating various applications and discussions between IT and PW, we have concluded that a link between RouteSmart and CRM cannot be installed. Therefore, the first step of soliciting a new Zero Waste software management system must address this. Then, a RFP for new routing software will be issued; IT-Customer Service will be soliciting a new CRM system.
2.3 Appoint individuals at the management, supervisory, and line staff levels to meet and identify Zero Waste Division operational and analytical reporting needs based on the performance goals at each level of the organization. Work with IT staff to determine responsibility and establish timelines for developing the reports.	Public Works	Agree.	September 2016	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Implemented ZWD along with IT, 311 Call Center, and Revenue Collection have established a monthly meeting to address operational and reporting needs; and create action plans to address those identified needs. These monthly reports included reviewing and analyzing as a Group: 1) monthly 311 calls on various the community members zero waste issues, 2) develop resolutions on community members' zero waste issues (reviewed weekly by 311 and ZWD personnel), and 3) review and resolve community members' LAGAN cases created by 311 calls.
2.4 Designate a business- line expert within the Zero Waste Division and require that expert to develop internal capacity to configure optimal collection routes and produce standardized reports for	Public Works	Agree	December 2018	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented In late 2016 and with RouteSmart™ staff input, ZWD reviewed its current staff capability to implement complete routing needs. And it was determined, the ZWD staff is not currently capable of this effort. ZWD has only recently achieved sufficient fund balance to have the funding ability to budget and requisition this job classification with its annual budget. With the completion of the optimization of

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
route specific reporting using existing software (or the software implementation of Recommendation 2.5 below). The reports developed should allow measurement of the performance metrics developed in Recommendation 1.2 and 1.3 above.			December 2019 May 2021	commercial routing, ZWD in collaboration with IT will propose to functivities position in FY2019. March 12, 2019 Update: Not Implemented Additional staffing positions have been proposed as part of the budget process with both the Senior Solid Waste Supervisor and an Associate Management Analyst being tasked with route optimization once new software has been identified and implemented. As mentioned elsewhere in this table, an RFP process for this software is currently underway. March 10, 2020 Partially Implemented Existing software (FUND\$ and RouteSmart™) are not capable or adaptable to allow configuration of optimal routing. IT received one proposal for an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System that includes a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System on October 18, 2018. Once the contract is finalized and the system installed, an RFP for Routing System may be released. With a user friendly routing system, performance metrics; such as, cart set out and participation rates cubic yards/tons collected; can be complied and reports developed.
2.5 Assess the benefits of using mobile technologies that would allow drivers to enter information directly into the CRM system while on their routes, take pictures of why pickups were skipped, and implement electronic route books and other mobile field reporting. Include in the assessment changes to job responsibilities that might require a meet and	Public Works	Agree The Zero Waste Division will work with Information Technology and Human Resources Departments to assess the pros, cons, and feasibilities of mobile technologies (hardware and software).	December 2019	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented ZWD with IT input has been working with the RouteSmart™ to determine if ZWD can utilize its mobile technology to improve route management and provide real-time service data to the customer service representatives in the 311 Call Centers. Fixed unit GPS units are available in the marketplace to track truck movements, such as, missed pickups. However and with any mobile technology, these systems are constantly involving and improving. Therefore, any investment in a mobile system will not be implemented until the City's ERP project vendor selected, contract awarded and then ZWD/IT needs assessment completed. March 12, 2019 Partially Implemented IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. The RFP was for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a

	ste Goal	vianuate: K	esources, strategic Plan, and Co	ommunication Need	ed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero
Find	lings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
	confer with union representatives. Purchase the software and hardware if cost beneficial.			January 2021	Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. These systems will utilize onboard mobile hardware. In addition, this system will integrate with the new GPS solution which will integrate with the Zero Waste solution allowing for real time decision making and route information. Exact capabilities of both systems will be validated and coordinated as part of the contracting process once the vendors are selected. March 10, 2020 Update Partially Implemented IT released an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System will allow a follow- up RFP for Route Optimization System on October 18, 2018. One proposal was received. IT and Legal are in the process of finalizing a contract with the vendor with software installation to follow. Once this system is installed and operating, an RFP for onboard truck/route/customer reporting system may be released.
2.6	Work jointly with the Department of Information Technology and the Department of Finance to develop and automate script flows in the CRM system to ensure that all cases undergo the appropriate reviews before a case can be closed. The final step in the script flow should be a final review by someone who has authority to verify that all required steps have occurred before the case is closed.	Public Works	Agree	October 2016	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Implemented. ZWD, IT, 311 Call Center, and Finance have developed script flows with use of the CRM tracking systems to ensure all cases receive appropriate review prior to closing. These cases are compiled and reviewed weekly and monthly by ZWD, IT, 311 Call Center, and Finance staff.

Findings and Recommendations		Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary	
2.7	Use the reports developed from implementing recommendation 2.4 To monitor customer complaints and determine what impact the annual bid process has on customer service. If the information demonstrates the annual bid process significantly affects customer service, meet and confer with union representatives to discuss the elimination the annual route bidding process to help reduce customer complaints and improve service delivery. Implement change if agreement is reached.	Public Works	Agree Zero Waste will use the CRM system to monitor customer complaints and help assess the effect of the yearly bid process.	January 2019 June/August 2019 January 2021	January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented. ZWD services 62 commercial route days and these ZWD's routes include: 42 refuse route days, 11 fiber (cardboard, paper) route days 5 mixed recyclable route days and 6 plant debris/food waste routes days. After the new commercial accounts are optimized with existing commercial accounts/routes, ZWD will be in the position to numerically determine if the annual bid system is affecting customer service. With this information completed, this would enable ZWD to meet and confer with the Union. June 4, 2018 Update: Not Implemented. With the integration of an additional 440 commercial accounts (had been serviced by either Waste Management, Inc. or Republic Services, Inc.) completed March/April 2018, with existing commercial accounts/routes, ZWD is in the position to numerically determine if the annual bid system is affecting customer service in April 2019. When this information is completed, ZWD will have information to meet and confer with the Union. March 12, 2019 Not Implemented The annual bid process is set to begin February 2019 and its impacts will be evaluated June 2019. March 10, 2020 Update: Not Implemented. Meet and confer with SEIU 1021 is ongoing and the Route Bid system as currently handled is in place. With the completion of the meet and confer, it will be reassessed at that time.	
2.8	Create a method for community members to track the status of their cases online, which will reduce the call volume to the 311 Call Center.	Information Technology	Agree This functionality will be available after the upgrade of our CRM system is complete, currently scheduled to be no later than the end of FY 2015.	June 2016	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented. Currently 311 team members create cases and assigned them to the appropriate service queue for ZWD investigation and response. This system allows the City to internally track issues but the ability of community member to track independently or via the City website has not been linked.	

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
			June 2020	Currently the City is implementing an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) project to replace the FUND\$ system and to update the City website. With the installation of the selected ERP, then the CRM system can be integrated with the ERP system. This integration would allow community members' to track their issues, such as, missed pickups, cost of service, etc. only. March 12, 2019 Not Implemented IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018 for a complete Zero Waste Solution. Software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019. Subsequently, I will be issuing an RFP for a new 311 system to replace LAGAN that we integrate with the Zero Waste solution. One of the objective of these new systems is to provide customers the ability to track their requests.
			January 2022	March 10, 2020 Update Partially Implemented IT released an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System will allow a follow up RFP for Route Optimization System on October 18, 2018. One proposal was received. IT and Legal are in the process of finalizing a contract with the vendor with software installation to follow. Once this system is installed and operating, an RFP for onboard truck/route/customer reporting system may be released. With an onboard system linked to Customer Relationship Management (CRN reporting system, customers could track status of their cases, such a missed pickups, late routes, etc.