

### CONSENT CALENDAR July 25, 2023

To: Honorable Mayor and Members of the City Council

From: Dee Williams-Ridley, City Manager

Submitted by: Liam Garland, Director, Department of Public Works

Subject: Audit Status Report: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan,

and Communication Needed to Continue Progress towards the Year 2020

Zero Waste Goal

### **INTRODUCTION**

The Office of the City Auditor presented a July 1, 2014 Report to the City Council: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal¹ (Audit Report). The City Auditor conducted the Audit Report at the Public Works Director's request to assess Zero Waste Division's progress towards the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal. This is the fifth and final status report on the efforts made to implement the Audit Report's recommendations, which are slated for no further follow-up action as recommended by the City Auditor for all audits more than five years old.

#### POLICY COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

On June 7, 2023, the Facilities, Infrastructure, Transportation, Environment & Sustainability Committee adopted the following action: M/S/C (Harrison/Robinson) to send the item to Council with a positive recommendation. Vote: Ayes – Robinson, Harrison; Noes – None; Abstain – None; Absent – Taplin.

#### **CURRENT SITUATION AND ITS EFFECTS**

The Audit Report noted fifteen (15) recommendations for the Public Works Department (PWD) and its Zero Waste Division (ZWD) to review, implement and report to Council. The first set of seven (7) recommendations was related to zero waste goals and ZWD's operational components, and the second set of eight (8) recommendations focused on collaborating with the Department of Information Technology (IT) to utilize technology to interface with Zero Waste routes, staff, and the customers.

Since the January 15, 2020 update on this Audit Report, Public Works has made additional progress on the implementation of recommendations. At the time of this

https://www.cityofberkeley.info/uploadedFiles/Auditor/Level 3 -General/A%202 RPT Zero%20Waste Final.pdf

Audit Status Report -- Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress
Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal

CONSENT CALENDAR July 25, 2023

report, the Auditor's Office verified three (3) of the recommendations as implemented and dropped the remaining twelve (12) recommendations.

#### **BACKGROUND**

Public Works' Zero Waste Division is responsible for the collection of residential material, including refuse, recycling, and composting; collection and processing of commercial material, including refuse, recycling, and composting; off-site hauling and composting of green/food waste for all customers; off-site hauling, sorting, and marketing of construction and demolition debris for all customers; and manages contracts related to the above work.

On March 22, 2015, the Berkeley City Council adopted Zero Waste Resolution No. 62,849-N.S. setting a goal of zero waste sent to landfills by the year 2020. The Resolution does not define a specific zero waste percentage expectation for Berkeley, but the language used therein suggests diversion of 100% of waste from landfills.

In its October 17, 2017 presentation to the City Council, the Zero Waste Commission recommended attaining the City's Zero Waste goal requires redefining the Zero Waste Goal and issuing a Request for Proposal (RFP) for a Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan. The City Council approved this recommendation.

On April 28, 2022, the City released the RFP, seeking qualified firms for the development and completion of an Integrated Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan (Plan) to provide methodologies and guidance for the City's Zero Waste Division's operation, personnel, program, and financial requirements to meet the City's Climate Action Plan and Zero Waste goals. The Plan's development will include robust public participation and outreach, along with City Council and staff input on both the draft and final Plan. City Council approved an item at the October 8, 2022 meeting to enter into a contract with the selected consultant for the Plan's development.

#### ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY AND CLIMATE IMPACTS

The increased diversion of compostable and recyclable materials is an essential part of the City's Zero Waste Goal as described in the City's 2009 Climate Action Plan.

#### POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION

Public Works' Zero Waste Division and the Zero Waste Commission will continue to take timely and focused action(s) to address outstanding and partially implemented recommendations.

#### FISCAL IMPACTS OF POSSIBLE FUTURE ACTION

The Integrated Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan has an approved budget of \$500,000. The AMCS financial software platform and associated professional services are budgeted for \$1.3 million for the first five years. There may be additional financial impacts to complete the remaining Audit findings.

#### **Page 3 of 19**

Audit Status Report -- Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal

CONSENT CALENDAR July 25, 2023

# **CONTACT PERSON**

Greg Apa, Solid Waste & Recycling Manager (510) 981-6359

#### Attachment:

1. Audit Findings and Recommendations Response Form

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
1.1 Request the City Council to redefine and then	Public Works	Agree This is consistent with the strategic	June 2015 June 2019	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented
reaffirm its commitment to zero waste (i.e., the percentage that the Council considers to be success), and to ensure sufficient resources to fund appropriate staffing and the necessary infrastructure	operational deficiencies and an organization more capal continuing the work to reach city's zero waste goal.  The Department is poised to undertake an open search of ZWD Manager whose input perspective, and anticipated professional expertise will essential in analyzing the reach search of the professory to achieve the goal.	Department has taken to correct operational deficiencies and create an organization more capable of continuing the work to reach the City's zero waste goal.  The Department is poised to undertake an open search for a new		The Zero Waste Commission submitted to the City Council its recommendation for the City to develop an RFP to: 1) develop a Z Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define an clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop pla for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The City Council concurred with this recommendation which was an item on its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar for the Zero Waste Division to develop the RFP for the development of the Plan.
to achieve stated goals by 2020.		perspective, and anticipated professional expertise will be essential in analyzing the resources necessary to achieve the goal and drafting suitable recommendations	June 2019  December 2019	6/04,2018 Update: Not Implemented The RFP is in development and should be released to solicit propose to be submitted during the second quarter FY2019.  March 12, 2019 Partially Implemented ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic P(Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review.
			November 2020	March 24, 2020 Update Partially Implemented At the September 17, 2019 City Council Work Session, Public and it consultant presented the proposed 5-year Rate Review that include additional staffing for implementation and compliance with State a StopWaste.org mandatory recycling and food waste. The Council provided input on the Rate Review is in review and adjusted Rates
			July 2023	with be presented to the City Council mid-2020.  November 13, 2022 Update  Dropped  Revised 5-year Rate Schedules presented at the December 7, 2021  City Council Work Session. Council consented to moving forward w  Proposition 218 process to approve Rates as proposed. In January

Findings and Recommendations		Lead Dept. Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary	
					2022, The City Agenda Committee placed the revised 5-year rate schedules on pause.
1.2	Draft and obtain Council approval of a written strategic plan to achieve zero waste by 2020, including annual or biennial interim waste diversion goals.  Topics that the strategic plan should discuss include:  Objectives and longterm and interim goals  Actions to be taken  Responsible parties  Expected cost and impact of implementation  Performance measures  External factors affecting performance and progress	Public Works	The Public Works Department has taken a strategic approach to solving the structural deficit and making progress toward our Zero Waste goal. The Department improved the efficiency of operations, followed the strategies in the Climate Action Plan, is currently completing a commercial franchise study, and in May 2014 completed a Prop 218-compliant rate increase. PW will continue to focus on maintaining efficient operations, high quality customer service, and improvements to waste diversion efforts.  The Department will take the next step toward zero waste by reassessing the current situation, and developing a strategic plan intended to guide the Department through the increasingly difficult path to zero waste. Part of this process requires evaluating the existing Transfer Station infrastructure, along with what might be required to reach the Zero Waste goal as defined.  The strategic plan will be flexible so that annual work plans can be designed to address changing conditions.  Public Works will build upon relevant	June 2019  June 2019  December 2019  May 2021	January 23, 2018 Update:  Not Implemented  The City's Solid Waste Management Plan (1998) and Source Reduction and Recycling Element (1992) are the City's most recent documents guiding the City's actions toward the goal of zero waste. Although the City's Solid Waste Management Plan Update (2005) wasn't formerly adopted by the City, it was designed to achieve the 2010 goal of reaching 75% diversion. The City is currently achieving 76% diversion based on FY2015 information. The Zero Waste Commission and the City Auditor each concluded independently that a comprehensive, written strategic plan that clearly defines roles and responsibilities and assigns sufficient resources is needed to guide the City towards the goal of achieving zero waste. The Zero Waste Commission recommended and the Cit Council concurred at its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar concurred with Zero Waste Commission's recommendation for Public Works' Zero Waste Division to develop an RFP to: develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan to delineate terminology, define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and develop plan to attain the define Strategic Plan's Zero Waste Goal. 6/04,2018 Update: Not Implemented These issues will be included in the development of RFP that will be advertised for proposals the second quarter FY2019. March 12, 2019 Partially Implemented ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Pla (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review. March 24, 2020 Update Partially Implemented With installation and implementation of the Zero Waste Division's management software (vendor is AMCS and projected to be

Finc	lings and Recommendations	Public	Agree and Corrective Action Plan  content in the 2005 Solid Waste Management Plan, the 2009 Climate Action Plan, and incorporate input from the Zero Waste Commission.  Agree Public Works will continue to prepare its annual work plan under the direction of the City Manager, in coordination and consistent with other Department work plans. Goals, objectives, and actions for the Zero Waste program will be organized and managed by the Zero Waste Manager.	August 2024  June 2019  December 2019	Implementation Progress Summary  completed late 2020), the City can assure Strategic Plan proposes that customers information is accurate and verifiable (FUND\$ cannot). Then the RFP for a Zero Waste Strategic Plan will then be issued and this Plan will develop strategies to attain the City's zero waste goal. RFP for Integrated Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan released November 13, 2022 Update  Dropped  The AMCS software financial platform will not be fully implemented until July 2024. An RFP for an Integrated Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan (Plan) was released April 28, 2022. An October 8, 2022 City Council Consent Item was submitted for award of contract for development of the Plan to the selected consultant. The implementation of the AMCS platform and the Plan development will be conducted and coordinated in unison.  5/09/2017 Status: not submitted January 23, 2018 Update: Not Implemented  The Zero Waste Commission submitted to the City Council its recommendation for the City to develop an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The City Council concurred with this recommendation which was an item on its October 17, 2017 Action Calendar for the Zero Waste Division to develop the RFP for the development of the Plan.  With a third-party firm in-place, the Plan development will proceed with all stakeholders' input solicited, reviewed and included. With approved by both the Zero Waste Strategic Plan will provide Public Works a detailed road map to attain a Zero Waste goal. With these elements agree to then annual/biennial goals, budget allocations, timelines for completion, employees' assigned task and performance measures will be concisely identified and assigned to meet the Zero Waste goal.  March 12, 2019  Partially implemented
1.3	Prepare detailed annual work plans that contain:  Objectives Annual/biennial (short-term) goals Actions to be taken Budget allocated for the actions Timeline for completion Lead staff responsible for task completion Full-time equivalent employees assigned to the tasks Performance				

Find	dings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
					City's policy and decision making and paths of implementation to the goal of Zero Waste. IT and ZWD are in the process of selecting a vendor to implement an entirely new ZW software solution that includes routing, billing and work orders. ZW meets weekly with key PW staff to ensure division objectives and action items are prioritize and budgeted for. With the first reading and passing of the Single Us Foodware and Litter Reduction Ordinance on January 22, 2019, ZWD is working closely with PW Fiscal and Admin division to budget for adequate staffing for this new responsibility. ZWD anticipates completion of a Feasibility Study to replace the existing Transfer Station by mid-2019. ZWD primary objectives are in accordance with the Citywide Strategic Plan. Once the new ZW software system is in place and the Strategic Plan has been completed, a more accurate work plan could be created that would include performance
				May 2022	March 24, 2020 Update  Partially Implemented  With installation and implementation of the Zero Waste Division's management software (vendor is AMCS and projected to be completed lat 2020), the City can assure Strategic Plan proposes that customers information is accurate and verifiable (FUND\$ cannot). With completion of this step, the City can issue an RFP for a new user-friendly routing system. With a new Routing system, reliable, verifiable and accurate performance metrics can be developed. The cost of these systems and additional staffin required have been included in projected budgets.
				August 2024	November 13, 2022 Update  Dropped  The AMCS software financial platform will not be fully implemented until July 2024. An RFP for an Integrated Zero Waste Management Strategic Plan (Plan) was released April 28, 2022. An October 8, 2022 City Council Conserted was submitted for award of contract for development of the Plan to the selected consultant. The implementation of the AMCS platform and the Plan development will be conducted and coordinated in unison.
1.4	Regularly communicate zero waste goals and achievements to City staff and the Council, and offer training to staff on how they can help	Public Works	Agree Prepare an annual report to Council, highlighting progress toward strategic plan and work plan goals to achieve zero waste in Berkeley.	December 2019	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  January 23, 2018 Update:  Partially Implemented  With the newly re-staffed ZWC and new management at Zero Waste Division and once the Strategic Plan is completed and as part of the Strategic Plan, the Work Plan with goals, budget, timelines, FTEs and measurements will be developed. Then, Public Works will initiate

indings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
Berkeley achieve zero waste. This includes sharing strategic and annual work plan goals and regular updates regarding progress and completion.				annual reporting to Council. Nonetheless progress has been made, such as: the ZWD has undertaken a City Facilities Greening Project to ensure that all City-owned facilities have the appropriate containers with signage for trash, recyclables (bottles/cans and fiber), and organics; and that City staff receive training on the acceptable materials to place in each container type. The recent, May through September 2017, renovation of 1947 Center Street is being used as a pilot for this Project.  In celebration of Earth Day 2017, the ZWD hosted a Zero Waste Eart Day Fair for City employees to get answers to all of their recycling-related questions, play games, enjoy zero waste snacks, and talk tras with ZWD staff. This event was attended by more than 100 City employees.
			November 2021	March 12, 2019 Partially Implemented City staff have been encouraged to participate in the visioning sessions for the Transfer Station Redesign January 16, 17, and 18, 2019. Also, ZWD has developed an RFP to: 1) develop a Zero Waste Strategic Plan (Plan) to delineate terminology, 2) define and clarify what the City's Zero Waste Goal will be, and 3) develop plan for the Public Works - Zero Waste Division to implement to attain that goal. The RFP is in administrative review. Once the strategic plan is completed, it will be shared with City staff.
			November 2021	March 24, 2020 Update  Partially Implemented  At the Council's Work Sessions for Rate Review (September 17, 201 and Solid Waste & Recycling Transfer Station Feasibility Study (November 5, 2019), PW informed Council of the need for additional RFPs, staffing, funding and facility requirements to meet the City's zero waste goal.
			August 2024	November 13, 2022 Update Dropped Revised 5-year Rate Schedules was presented at the December 7, 2021 City Council Work Session. Council consented to moving forwa with Proposition 218 process for property owner consent of the revised Rates as proposed. These Revised Schedules included additional costs for: 1) Ecology and CCC contracts (\$85 mil over 10 years, sole sourced per Council direction); staffing for AB 341 & 1820 (commercial recycling), SB1383 (organic recycling) and Single Use

Findings and Recommendations		Lead Dept. Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan		Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
					Disposal Foodware and Litter Reduction Ordinance compliance; and CEQA compliance work for Transfer Station Replacement Concepts A and B. In January 2022, The City Agenda Committee placed the revised 5-year rate schedules on pause.
1.5	Determine if additional funds are needed for the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero waste goals. If sufficient funds are not available, propose to Council a separate fee to cover those costs for the City's zero- waste program, such as a regulatory fee as allowed under Proposition 218.	Public Works	The Public Works Strategic Plan process will evaluate and identify the necessary resources, and if funding is insufficient, a recommendation will be made to consider an Integrated Waste Management Fee or other appropriate mechanism to fund additional staffing and/or outreach needs.	December 2019	January 23, 2018 Update: Partially Implemented Since September 2016, Public Works has hired the Zero Waste Division's Solid Waste & Recycling Manager, Greg Apa, and Recycling Program Manager, Heidi Obermeit, who have 29 and 10 years, respectively, of solid waste industry experience. With their extensiv background in the solid waste industry, they are in the process of reviewing, assessing and addressing Zero Waste's current efforts to educate and as needed the expansion of educational outreach to the community members and commercial businesses, both existing and new. Outreach educational materials are somewhat dated and thes materials may be updated and customized as required with more current graphics and narratives. In addition, the ZWD has hired a Field Service Representative who assists ZWD's education and compliance efforts with all community members and businesses. In 2018, the current Council approved rate structure will require an updated rate study including the cost of increased educational outreach and training for handling of recyclable materials to ensure sustainable rate structure to achieve the zero waste goals that the Council has set for Public Waste and Zero Waste Division.  March 12, 2019 Partially Implemented Public Works has determined through internal budget process that Zero Waste needs two additional full-time staff members to oversee the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero-waste goals. The Zero Waste Division will be determining additional funding beyond staffing needed to increase education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement during the strategic plannin process. The RFP for the strategic plan process is currently under administrative review. This process will also identify if the current levels of fees can cover the costs of the City's Zero Waste program o if Public Works will need to assess additional fees.

Find	lings and Recommendations		Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date  November 2021  July 2023	March 24, 2020 Partially Implemented July 2019, City Council approved the hiring two additional full-time staff members to oversee the education, outreach, compliance, and enforcement necessary to reach zero waste goals. At a September 17, 2019 City Council Work Session on the current Rate Review Study Council provided Public Works and its consultant direction to provide ongoing and additional services to be funded by the Zero Waste Fundan update of the Rate Review Study will be scheduled with the City Council mid-2020.  November 13, 2022 Update  Dropped  Revised 5-year Rate Schedules was presented at the December 7, 2021 City Council Work Session. Council consented to moving forwar with Proposition 218 process for property owner consent of the revised Rates as proposed. These Revised Schedules included additional costs for: 1) Ecology and CCC contracts (\$85 mil over 10 years, sole sourced per Council direction); staffing for AB 341 & 1826 SB1383 and Single Use Disposal Plastic and Litter Reduction Ordinance compliance; and CEQA compliance work for Transfer Station Replacement Concepts A and B. In January 2022, The City Agenda Committee placed the revised 5-year rate schedules on pause.
1.6	Update the City's Zero Waste website to include easily accessible information regarding:  • How and where to recycle materials that are not accepted in curbside collection.  • What can be brought to the transfer station and materials recovery facility.	Public Works	Agree	October 2016	January 23, 2018 Update: Implemented With the hiring of the Recycle Program Manager, ZWD is continuously streamlining and updating the City's and ZWD's website to include: guidelines to recycle plant debris and food waste; information on the mandatory recycling requirements for businesses and multi-family properties in Alameda County; and links to other recycling resources in the area. Further, the ZWD has made available guidelines to help designers of multifamily, commercial, and mixed-use buildings plan for recycling collection when designing new buildings or renovations. In conjunction with the City's Public Information Officer, the ZWD has distributed press releases to educate the general public about the appropriate material to place in their refuse, recycling and green compost carts, extra pick-up bags, proper cart placement.

Find	lings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
	Zero waste goals and progress toward those goals.  StopWaste.org is a good example and has resources that Berkeley can direct customers to use.  Updates should be made as changes are made to the list of materials accepted through each waste stream.				
1.7	Engage in discussions with the California Department of Resources Recycling and Recovery to obtain permission to collect garbage biweekly instead of weekly while maintaining weekly collection of compostables. Perform additional education and outreach prior to implementing biweekly garbage service to educate the public on the change. Alternatively, seek permission to implement a pilot project for biweekly garbage service.	Public Works	Agree  The ZWD will investigate the process of obtaining legal permission to pilot biweekly rubbish collection. We will identify the operational and outreach preparation necessary to evaluate the feasibility of this pilot.	N/A	January 23, 2018 Update:  Dropped  Although a Solid Waste & Recycling Manager and Recycling Program Manager is on staff, the Zero Waste Division, as an enterprise funde collection service division, is unstaffed and inexperienced to engage in the process change of State Law, which requires weekly collection of refuse. In addition, this would require significant lobbying of CalRecycle to approve a pilot program to collect refuse other than of a weekly basis.  The Audit Report states that there is the potential of \$496,000 annuticost savings by switching to biweekly garbage service. However, and as noted in the Audit Report, this is based on assumptions which:  1) State law requires the refuse shall not remain on any premises more than seven (7) days. Berkeley would need to revise the State law, request a waiver or seek permission for a pilot program. This waiver or revision of State law will potentially require substantial lobbying members of City Council, State House of Representative(s) and Senator(s), as well as, of all the many County and State permitting and health agencies that would be involved to amend State law.

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
Finding 2: Limited use of availa	nle technolog	ries affects operational efficiencies		<ul> <li>2) Require additional staff and funding to support a community educational outreach to ensure that refuse is not just reallocated by community members to the recycling and plant debris carts.</li> <li>3) Public Works would need to enter into negotiations with the employee bargaining unit to an agreement whether positions can be eliminated through attrition or reassignment.</li> </ul>
2.1 Work with the	Public	Agree		5/09/2017 Status: not submitted
Department of Information Technology to configure the CRM system with a required field that auto populates valid route information based on address and service delivery type so that route specific data can be collected on a going-forward basis.	Works		December 2019	January 23, 2018 Update:  Not implemented  Currently the City is implementing an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) project to replace the FUND\$ system including the CRM application. ERP is a software with financial (accounting, billing, budget, contracts) and human resource (time entry, personnel, payroll, benefits) applications. As part of this project, ZWD has bee working with IT and its consultant during the needs assessment phato ensure that RouteSmart™ will interface with the selected softward June 4, 2018 Update:  Not implemented  IT with ZWD is soliciting many companies to demonstrate their invoicing, customer service, and routing systems. With the conclusion of the demonstrations, IT will develop an RFP that will soloist proposals for systems that will integrate with Erma.  March 12, 2019  Not Implemented  IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. As the FUND\$ system in the process of being replaced, a new system was deemed necessary and IT issued an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Rour Optimization System. One proposal was received. If the proposal is accepted, software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019.  The new system will require route optimization and will have an

	aste Goal	indings and Recommendations Lead Dept. Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Expected or Actual Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and							
Fine	dings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Implementation Date  November 2022  July 2024	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary				
					collected on a going-forward basis. The details of this system will be evaluated and developed as part of implementation.  In addition to these new systems, Public Works and Parks are also implementing a new computerized maintenance management system. Once that vendor has been selected, then 311 will issue an RFP for a new Customer Relationship Management system that will integrate with the Zero Waste solutions.  March 24, 2020 Update  Not Implemented  IT is finalizing the contract the new Zero Waste software management system and to be completed late 2020. After this in operation, RFPs will be issued for new Routing and CRM system.  When these are operational, CRM will be able to integrate routing information.  November 13, 2022 Update  Dropped  Contract awarded to AMCS to install new customer account & financial software platform to be up and running by mid-2024.				
2.2	Work with the Department of Information Technology to create a link between RouteSmart and the CRM system (or the software implementation of Recommendation 2.5 below).	Public Works	Agree Zero Waste will work with IT to create the most efficient link between RouteSmart™ and the CRM system that can be created, given available resources. One solution, budget permitting, would be implementing the best of breed billing system that integrates with RouteSmart, rather than to trying to configure the CRM system to handle functions it was never designed to handle.	April 2015  December 2019	January 23, 2018 Update:  Not Implemented  IT has been able to create a table that extracts customer information from the FUND\$ and RouteSmart™. However, and due to the limitations of FUND\$, this link takes hours to download information into RouteSmart™ versus that the company states should take minutes. Therefore, until the installation of the ERP process is completed, RouteSmart™ cannot be used to its full route optimization capabilities.  March 12, 2019  Not Implemented  Working with RouteSmart™ for further integration was deemed not worthwhile as that system does not integrate with ArcGIS which is the City's primary system for spatial data. IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. The RFP was for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. One proposal was received. If the proposal is				

Find	lings and Recommendations		Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date  November 2022  August 2024	accepted, software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019. In addition to these new systems, Public Works and Parks are also implementing a new computerized maintenance management system. Once that vendor has been selected, then 311 will issue an RFP for a new Customer Relationship Management system that will integrate with the Zero Waste solutions.  March 24, 2020 Update:  Not Implemented  After evaluating various applications and discussed by IT. IT-CS and PW, a link between RouteSmart and CRM cannot be installed. Therefore, the first step of soliciting a new Zero Waste software management system. Then, an RFP for new routing software will be issued. In IT-CS will be soliciting a new CRM system.  November 13, 2022 Update  Dropped  Contract awarded to AMCS to install new customer account & financial software platform to be up and running by mid-2024.
2.3	Appoint individuals at the management, supervisory, and line staff levels to meet and identify Zero Waste Division operational and analytical reporting needs based on the performance goals at each level of the organization. Work with IT staff to determine responsibility and establish timelines for developing the reports.	Public Works	Agree.	September 2016	January 23, 2018 Update: Implemented ZWD along with IT, 311 Call Center, and Revenue Collection have established a monthly meeting to address operational and reporting needs; and create action plans to address those identified needs. These monthly reports included reviewing and analyzing as a Group: 1) monthly 311 calls on various the community members zero waste issues, 2) develop resolutions on community members' zero waste issues (reviewed weekly by 311 and ZWD personnel), and 3) review and resolve community members' LAGAN cases created by 311 calls.
2.4	Designate a business- line expert within the	Public Works	Agree	December 2018	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  January 23, 2018 Update:

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
Zero Waste Division and require that expert to develop internal capacity to configure optimal collection routes and produce standardized reports for route specific reporting using existing software (or the software implementation of Recommendation 2.5 below). The reports developed should allow measurement of the performance metrics developed in Recommendation 1.2 and 1.3 above.			December 2019  May 2021	In late 2016 and with RouteSmart™ staff input, ZWD reviewed its current staff capability to implement complete routing needs. And it was determined, the ZWD staff is not currently capable of this effort. ZWD has only recently achieved sufficient fund balance to have the funding ability to budget and requisition this job classification with its annual budget. With the completion of the optimization of commercial routing, ZWD in collaboration with IT will propose to function in FY2019.  March 12, 2019 Update:  Not Implemented  Additional staffing positions have been proposed as part of the budget process with both the Senior Solid Waste Supervisor and an Associate Management Analyst being tasked with route optimization once new software has been identified and implemented. As mentioned elsewhere in this table, an RFP process for this software is currently underway.  March 24, 2020  Dropped  Existing software (FUND\$ and RouteSmart™) are not capable or adaptable to allow configuration of optimal routing. IT received one proposal for an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System that includes a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System on October 18, 2018. Once the contract is finalized and the system installed, an RFP for Routing System may be released. With a user-friendly routing system, performance metrics; such as, cart set out and participation rates cubic yards/tons collected; can be complied and reports developed.
2.5 Assess the benefits of using mobile technologies that would allow drivers to enter information directly into the CRM system while on their routes, take pictures of why pickups were skipped, and implement electronic	Public Works	Agree The Zero Waste Division will work with Information Technology and Human Resources Departments to assess the pros, cons, and feasibilities of mobile technologies (hardware and software).		January 23, 2018 Update:  Not Implemented  ZWD with IT input has been working with the RouteSmart™ to determine if ZWD can utilize its mobile technology to improve route management and provide real-time service data to the customer service representatives in the 311 Call Centers. Fixed unit GPS units are available in the marketplace to track truck movements, such as, missed pickups. However, and with any mobile technology, these systems are constantly involving and improving. Therefore, any investment in a mobile system will not be implemented until the

indings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
route books and other mobile field reporting. Include in the			December 2019	City's ERP project vendor selected, contract awarded and then ZWD/IT needs assessment completed.  March 12, 2019
assessment changes to job responsibilities that might require a meet an confer with union representatives.  Purchase the software	3			Partially Implemented IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018. The RFP was for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System and a Route Optimization System. These systems will utilize onboard mobile hardware. In addition, this syste
and hardware if cost beneficial.				will integrate with the new GPS solution which will integrate with the Zero Waste solution allowing for real time decision making and rout information. Exact capabilities of both systems will be validated and coordinated as part of the contracting process once the vendors are selected.
			January 2021	March 24, 2020 Update Partly Implemented IT released an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste Computerized Maintenance Management System will allow a follow up RFP for Route Optimization System on October 18, 2018. One proposal was received. IT and Legal are in the process of finalizing a contract with the vendor with software installation to follow. Once this system is installed and operating, an RFP for onboard truck/route/customer reporting system may be released.
			August 2024	November 13, 2022 Update  Dropped  Contract awarded to AMCS to install new customer account & financial software platform to be up and running by mid-2024.
2.6 Work jointly with the Department of Information Technology	Public Works	Agree	October 2016	5/09/2017 Status: not submitted  January 23, 2018 Update:
and the Department of Finance to develop and automate script flows in the CRM system to ensure that all cases				Implemented ZWD, IT, 311 Call Center, and Finance have developed script flows with use of the CRM tracking systems to ensure all cases receive appropriate review prior to closing. These cases are compiled and reviewed weekly and monthly by ZWD, IT, 311 Call Center, and Finance staff.

Findings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary
reviews before a case can be closed. The final step in the script flow should be a final review by someone who has authority to verify that all required steps have occurred before the case is closed.				
2.7 Use the reports developed from implementing recommendation 2.4 To monitor customer complaints and determine what impact the annual bid process has on customer service. If the information demonstrates the annual bid process significantly affects customer service, meet and confer with union representatives to discuss the	Public Works	Agree Zero Waste will use the CRM system to monitor customer complaints and help assess the effect of the yearly bid process.	January 2019	January 23, 2018 Update:  Not Implemented  ZWD services 62 commercial route days and these ZWD's routes include: 42 refuse route days, 11 fiber (cardboard, paper) route days, 5 mixed recyclable route days and 6 plant debris/food waste routes days. After the new commercial accounts are optimized with existing commercial accounts/routes, ZWD will be in the position to numerically determine if the annual bid system is affecting customer service. With this information completed, this would enable ZWD to meet and confer with the Union.  June 4, 2018 Update:  Not Implemented  With the integration of an additional 440 commercial accounts (had been serviced by either Waste Management, Inc. or Republic Services, Inc.) completed March/April 2018, with existing commercial accounts/routes, ZWD is in the position to numerically determine if the annual bid system is affecting customer service in April 2019.  When this information is completed, ZWD will have information to meet and confer with the Union.
elimination the annual route bidding process to help reduce customer complaints			June/August 2019	March 12, 2019 Not Implemented The annual bid process is set to begin February 2019 and its impacts will be evaluated June 2019.
and improve service delivery.  Implement change if			January 2021	March 24, 2020 Update:  Dropped  Meet and confer with SEIU 1021 is ongoing and the Route Bid system as currently handled is in place. With the completion of the meet and confer, it will be reassessed at that time.

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero Waste Goal						
Find	dings and Recommendations	Lead Dept.	Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Expected or Actual Implementation Date	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and Implementation Progress Summary	
	agreement is reached.					
2.8	Create a method for community members to track the status of their cases online, which will reduce the call volume to the 311 Call Center.	Information Technology	Agree This functionality will be available after the upgrade of our CRM system is complete, currently scheduled to be no later than the end of FY 2015.	June 2016	January 23, 2018 Update:  Not Implemented  Currently 311 team members create cases and assigned them to the appropriate service queue for ZWD investigation and response. This system allows the City to internally track issues but the ability of community member to track independently or via the City website has not been linked.  Currently the City is implementing an Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) project to replace the FUND\$ system and to update the City website. With the installation of the selected ERP, then the CRM system can be integrated with the ERP system. This integration would allow community members' to track their issues, such as, missed pickups, cost of service, etc. only.  March 12, 2019  Not Implemented  IT released an RFP on behalf of Public Works for Zero Waste Management software on October 18, 2018 for a complete Zero Waste Solution. Software installation and implementation is anticipated to begin immediately upon contract execution in May 2019, with software operational by December 2019. Subsequently, IT will be issuing an RFP for a new 311 system to replace LAGAN that will integrate with the Zero Waste solution. One of the objectives of these new systems is to provide customers the ability to track their	
				January 2022	requests.  March 24, 2020 Update  Partially Implemented  IT released an RFP for a Zero Waste Management System and  Professional Services consisting of a Waste Billing System, a Waste  Computerized Maintenance Management System will allow a follow- up RFP for Route Optimization System on October 18, 2018. One proposal was received. IT and Legal are in the process of finalizing a contract with the vendor with software installation to follow. Once this system is installed and operating, an RFP for onboard truck/route/customer reporting system may be released. With an onboard system linked to Customer Relationship Management (CRM)	

Audit Title: Underfunded Mandate: Resources, Strategic Plan, and Communication Needed to Continue Progress Toward the Year 2020 Zero						
Waste Goal						
Findings and Recommendations Lead Dept.		Agree, Partially Agree, or Do Not	Expected or Actual	Status of Outstanding Audit Recommendations and		
		Agree and Corrective Action Plan	Implementation	Implementation Progress Summary		
			Date			
				reporting system, customers could track status of their cases, such as,		
			August 2024	missed pickups, late routes, etc		
			7146431 2024	November 13, 2022 Update		
				Dropped		
				Contract awarded to AMCS to install new customer account &		
				financial software platform to be up and running by mid-2024.		